Short paper (4 pages in ACM-format) Research project and academic publishing, DMD 15 ECTS - referee's comments

Course description:

https://mit.itu.dk/ucs/cb/course.sml?course_id=1232604&mode=search&goto=1351772138.000

Author(s) of article: Energy and Resource Management in Games, paper 11

Title of article:

Referee's name:

	Strong Yes	Weak Yes	Average	Weak No	Strong No
Is the paper interesting, timely and thought provoking?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the subject matter relevant to the DMD area?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the intellectual level appropriate?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the paper written and structured clearly?	5	4	3	2	1
Are there adequate references to related work?	5	4	3	2	1
Are there sufficient graphics?	5	4	3	2	1

Recommendation (select one only)

- Accept with no changes
- Accept with minor changes
- Request a major revision
- Reject

Comments for the editors only:

.....

Comments which may be shown anonymously to the author(s):

The paper presents how games could create a level of awareness towards energy use and management. However, the paper needs to address many points before the text becomes ready for publication. First the research question needs to be rephrased in order to better fit the scope of the research. The language used is not appropriate in an academic paper, and

the wording should fit more agreeably with academic standards. The literature in the field should be better defined and extended in order to better ground the subject.

The authors chose two games in order to illustrate and be the case of the study. However their methodology presentation is insufficient, lacking basic data such as how many informants, age, gender and when the tests took place. This should be complemented by the definition of the groups chosen, how they defined a "less experienced" and "experienced" gamers in order to apply the tests. The conclusions drawn from the research become then less valid with the lack of further information as described above. Furthermore, testing individual learning and perception through such a test can be a delicate subject, as it is questionable how this truly creates or not an awareness of the energy subject.

Finally, this paper, despite its relevant topic, still needs a great deal of work in order to be ready for publication.

Referees are asked to complete this form electronically and return it to: malmborg@itu.dk, jensp@itu.dk, annehvejsel@itu.dk, nmpe@itu.dk