

Short paper (4 pages in ACM-format) Research project and academic publishing, DMD 15 ECTS - referee's comments

Course description:

https://mit.itu.dk/ucs/cb/course.sml?course_id=1232604&mode=search&goto=1351772138.000

Author(s) of article: Punishment and reward as motivational factors, paper 12

Title of article:

Referee's name:

	<i>Strong Yes</i>	<i>Weak Yes</i>	<i>Average</i>	<i>Weak No</i>	<i>Strong No</i>
Is the paper interesting, timely and thought provoking?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the subject matter relevant to the DMD area?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the intellectual level appropriate?	5	4	3	2	1
Is the paper written and structured clearly?	5	4	3	2	1
Are there adequate references to related work?	5	4	3	2	1
Are there sufficient graphics?	5	4	3	2	1

Recommendation (select one only)

- Accept with no changes
- Accept with minor changes
- Request a major revision
- Reject

Comments for the editors only:

Comments which may be shown anonymously to the author(s):

The paper started in a very interesting way and raising some relevant questions in the field. It was also very positive and daring to develop a game in order to use it as a testing platform. However the article has innumerable points which need to be addressed. First and foremost the definitions of the main concepts, reward and punishment, should have been introduced based on scholarly articles instead of using an online dictionary one. They could even have brought

up the use of such terms from philosophy, such as Foucault; or literature, such as Dostoyevsky. It should also have acknowledged existing literature on video games for therapeutic purposes and developed further on serious games. The results also need to be better analysed and the groups tested need to be better defined (which type of gamers, age, and when the tests took place). Furthermore the paper is not fully finished with comments addressing further edition and it lacks a more elaborate discussion and conclusion.

Finally, this paper, despite its interesting initial approach, still needs a great deal of work in order to be ready for publication.

Referees are asked to complete this form electronically and return it to:
malmborg@itu.dk, jensp@itu.dk, annehvejsel@itu.dk, nmpe@itu.dk